Updates/Status of Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation On the CY 2021 COA Annual Audit Report and Prior Years Audit Findings and Recommendations As of December 30, 2022

Regional Office/Attached Agency: <u>Employees Compensation Commission</u> Auditor's Opinion: <u>Unmodified/Unqualified</u>

COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
ECC building amounting to P144.128 million determined in CY 2014 was not updated, and the fair values of the land where the ECC building stands and Center's building were not disclosed in the financial statements (FS),	 to undertake the appraisal of the ECC building, ECC land located in Makati City and Center's building in Quezon City, and disclose in the FS the current/updated fair values of the said properties; and b.Issue a policy on appraisal or revaluation of PE to include the frequency or necessity of the appraisal in order to determine the changes in their fair values and 	Complied.	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
2	The Accounts Payable (AP) account includes liabilities amounting to P1.540 million that have remained outstanding in the books for three to 16 years, which casts doubt on the validity of the	balances were merely caused by coding errors;	Some accounts are still for verification especially those related to the provision of prosthesis. All appropriate adjustments of AP will be reflected in the Books	EO Dec 2022
	payables , contrary to Paragraphs 3.2 and 3.4 of the Conceptual Framework for GPFR by Public Sector Entities.	contracts with the creditors, particularly on the expiry provisions within which the creditors can file for the claims;		
		c. Record appropriate accounting entries for recommendations (a) and (b);	Continuing.	
		d. After conducting recommendations (a) and (b), send notices to payees of valid payables, have them file their claims with EC and immediately pay the amounts due them; and	Continuing.	
		e. Set target dues within which to clear the books of these long outstanding payables.	Completed.	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
3	Management was still unable to come up with one Restructuring Plan (RP) for approval of the Governance Commission for Government Owned or Controlled Corporations (GCG) to effect the Organizational Structure and Staffing Pattern appropriate for an integrated function and business of both ECC and OSHC which resulted in: (a) redundancy of positions and functions of ECC and OSHC and (b) accountabilities and responsibilities of ECC and OSHC's officials and employees are not properly defined. Such delay in the finalization of the RP entails higher administrative cost amounting to P12.594 million.	 years' recommendations that Management: a. Fast track the preparation and submission to GCG of the required RP that considers the proper delineation of the accountabilities and responsibilities of the ECC Executive Director as well as the Center's officials and employees, the Center being a department of ECC, to avoid redundancy of positions and functions; and b. In the meantime, that the RP is not yet available, the ECC Board has to revisit the current organizational set up of the ECC and Center and to come up with appropriate guidelines to ensure proper check 	Continuing compliance. The ECC Governing Board (GB) approved the Board Resolution No. 22-12-38 Approving the Commencement of the Reorganization of the ECC and the OSHC and Providing its Guiding Principles and Governance Structure Continuing compliance. The ECC Governing Board (GB) approved the Board Resolution No. 22-12-39 Approving the Timelines in the Reorganization of the ECC and the OSHC	16 December 2022 16 December 2022

COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
ECC to enforce the a recommendation revoke/terminate authority granting Employers' Confederation the Philippines (ECOP) private organization, for occupancy of ECC's of space resulted in opportu- loss estimated at P8. million in rental income for CYs 2019 to 2021, then depriving the ECC of much - needed funds for benefits of its membi- Likewise, ECC's mandate manage a sound, strong,	 to that Management: a. Recommend to the ECC Board of Directors the revocation/termination of the board resolution granting ECOP the free occupancy of ECC's office space; b. Have ECOP enter a lease contract with ECC with rental rates based on the prevailing rate of the other leases of the ECC building; c. Determine applicable rental rates for the years 2019 to 2021 for the office space occupied by ECOP and issue billing statements/statement 	ECOP sent reply on November 24, 2022 re ECC's communication dated August 16, 2022 forwarding OP's opinion on the issue of ECOP's free occupancy of the portion of the ECC building ECC will draft the Contract of Lease for ECOP, subject to discussion with them	1 st Q 2023

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
5	account includes unserviceable properties amounting to P216,051 that remained undisposed due to non-determination of the	through the appropriate mode of disposal and submit the relevant	(Please see also 2020 Obs.3)	
	contrary to COA Circular No. 89-296, which may result in the further deterioration, decline in recoverable value	Inventory and Inspection Report on Unserviceable Property (IIRUP).	The Inventory and Inspection Report (IIR) will be submitted to COA upon completion of computation of appraised value	1 st Q 2023
	and incurrence of additional cost of maintaining the properties including the storage space.	This will be submitted to the ECC Bids and Awards Committee for disposal in order to determine the proper mode of disposition of said unserviceable properties. The target date to dispose these unserviceable properties is by the first semester of CY 2022.	Not yet disposed. The delay was due to retrieval of other unserviceable items from the REUs	
		However, even prior to the pandemic, Management did not take action in determining the proper mode of disposal for these unserviceable assets. The division in charge could at least had an inventory count to properly account the assets for disposal.		

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
6	The amount of time consumed on the evaluation of applications for cash assistance up to the issuance of the corresponding checks took longer than eight (8) days and 30 minutes as prescribed in the ECC Citizen's Charter, and longer than 20 working days as	handling processes that are usually handled by senior employees who are due for retirement in the coming	Completed. WCPRD coordinated with the Administrative Division for the hiring of needed staff - four (4) Medical Officers, one (1) Nurse III, two (2) Social Workers II and two 2 (two) Administrative Staff – all of them have permanent items; Notification of Appointment issued Nurse II (permanent item)	
	required under Section 9(b) of Republic Act (R.A.) No. 11032 or the Ease of Doing Business and Efficient Government Service Delivery Act (EODB Act) due to shortage on manpower and	equipment to hasten office tasks and upgrade the cash assistance	•	
	other technical issues that affected the efficiency of the process resulting in the delayed receipt of cash	 c. Practice resiliency by temporarily delegating tasks to other divisions; and 	Complied.	
	assistance by ECC members and their dependents.	d. Strictly comply with the prescribed processing time in the ECC Citizen's Charter and Section 9 of the Republic Act (RA) No. 11032 or the EODB Act.	Complied.	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/ Comments/Complian	the second se	the second s	Timeline
7	The absence of a guideline to implement the Katulong at Gabay ng Manggagawang may Kapansanan (KAGABAY) Program may result in the payment of the starter/ complimentary kit to unqualified ECC members, therefore not aligned with the objectives of the KAGABAY Program and contradicts Section 2 of P.D. No. 1445.	formulate and immediately issue a guideline/policy on the implementation of the KAGABAY	 Complied. The following guidelinand issued on FY2022: 1. Guidelines for Starter Kits/ Construction (SK/CK); 2. Guidelines for Physical Theration (PT/OT) 3. Guidelines for Prosthesis; 4. Guidelines for the Cash Advances 5. Guidelines for Skills Training for Skills	the Prov Compliment the Prov py / Occ) – new; the Prov the Prov for SK/CK; the Facili	vision of tary Kits vision of cupational vision of shment of and itation of	
8	The absence of a property or inventory card to monitor the movement of Information, Education and Communication (IEC) materials may result in overstocking, obsolescence, damage and/or loss and uncertainty of the correctness of the quantity on hand, contrary to Section 2 of P.D. No. 1445.	of the IEC materials and submit to the Audit Team the corresponding Inventory Report; b. Prepare and maintain property or inventory cards to monitor the stock movement of each IEC material; c. Consider the current stock level of	Complied. ECP A Guide for Employees An Employer's Guide on ECP FAQ ECP ECC Infocomics ECP Occupational and Work-related Board Resolution PD 626, as amended PD 626 (version March 15, 2022) KAGABAY	4 th Q distribution 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	Balance	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
9	setting the estimated travel time for the routes taken by drivers providing shuttle services to employees hampered the determination of the reasonableness of billed hours beyond the	include, among others, a provision on the estimated travel time for the different routes/destinations of service drivers; and Require the Administrative Division to	Complied.	
	scheduled working hours that may result in excessive overtime payments/ charges.	monitor the overtime services rendered by the ECC employees and their compliance to existing rules and regulations.		
10	The Daily Time Records of ECC employees who were assigned at the Department of Health (DOH) were not supported with the biometric/ machine - stamped bundy time cards or a log book as	Book V of EO 292 and CSC MC No. 21 s. 1991, on the use of bundy clock and other records of	Complied.	
	required under Section 2, Rule XVII of the Omnibus Rule Implementing Book V of EO 292 and Civil Service Commission Memorandum Circular (CSC -MC) No. 21, s. 1991, in relation to Section 13.b.6. of CSC MC No. 24, s.	 b. In the absence of the Office Order as an exemption on the use of bundy clock, require the employees to submit to ECC and to the Audit Team either of the three: (1) photocopy of attendance of book; (2) machine-stamped bundy clock card or; (3) extracted attendance 	Complied.	
	2017, thus, the validity of the reported attendance and	from biometric time clock.		

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
	accuracy of the salaries and benefits paid to these employees cannot be ascertained.			
11	documents covering the period January 1 to December 31, 2021 were not submitted to the Audit Team within the prescribed period,	100 and 107 of P.D. No. 1445; and		
	107 of P.D. No. 1445, which prevented the timely disclosure of any deficiencies and issuance of corresponding audit action.	b.Submit immediately the DVs and supporting documents not yet submitted as of February 18, 2022.	. .	
CY	2020 AAR			
1	Management was still unable to come up with one Restructuring Plan for approval of the Governance Commission for Government Owned or Controlled Corporations (GCG) to effect the Organizational Structure and Staffing Pattern appropriate for an integrated function and business of both ECC and OSHC which	of the ECC Executive Director as well as the Center's officials and employees, the Center being a department of ECC, to avoid		

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
posit ECC acco resp OSH emp defin finali restr	Ited in: (a) redundancy of tions and functions of and OSHC and (b) ountabilities and onsibilities of ECC and IC's officials and loyees are not properly ned. Such delay in the ization of the ructuring plan entails er administrative cost		Continuing compliance. Reiterated in 2021 Obs. 3	
2 The Emp Com revol auth Emp the priva occu spac 4(2) resu estin renta		 a. Revoke/terminate the authority granting ECOP a free occupancy of ECC's office space; b. Have ECOP enter a lease contract with ECC with rental rates based on the prevailing rate of the other leases of ECC building; and c. If a lease agreement is not reached, offer the space to other tenants through public bidding. 	Continuing compliance. Reiterated in 2021 Obs. 3	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
3	(PE), contrary to Sections IV and V of COA Circular No. 80 -124. Also, the PE accounts include unserviceable PEs with carrying amount of P94,557, contrary to Paragraph 82 of International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) 17.	unserviceable properties in accordance with COA Circular No. 89 -296 and require the Accounting Department to derecognize from the books of accounts the carrying amounts of the unserviceable	•	
CY	2019 AAR			
1	The EC did not avail of the free internet service of the Department of information and Communication Technology (DICT) which could have reduced the	a. Immediately request and closely coordinate with DICT for their availment of free internet service pursuant to RA No. 10844; and	The ECC opted to procure new ISP due to	
	ECC's Communication expenses by P302,858.00 for CY 2019.	b. Terminate the contract with Source Telecom Inc. upon the availability of the free internet from DICT.	Complied.	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
CY	2015 AAR			
1	 P167,483.00 acquired through foreclosure were not consolidated in the name of the ECC notwithstanding the lapse of six years after the expiration of the one-year redemption period. The Subject Properties are located at Brgy. Miranda, 			
	Municipality of Talisay, Batangas, which contains a total area of Eight Thousand Four Hundred Sixty-Six (8,466) square meters, more or less, covered by TCT Nos. T-27984 and T-27985.		Conversion of the two certificates of title into E-Copies by filing a Petition for conversion before the Registry of Deeds of Makati City Filing of DAR Clearance application before DAR MARO of Talisay, Batangas can be done	by EO Jan 2023 by Feb/Mar 2023

Prepared by:

CLAUDINE B. RODRIGUEZ IAU [(D) - ECC OO 294]

19 January 2023

Noted by:

ENGR. JOSE MARIA S. BATINO, CESO IV Acting Executive Director

Updates/Status of Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation On the CY 2021 COA Annual Audit Report and Prior Years Audit Findings and Recommendations As of September 30, 2022

Regional Office/Attached Agency: <u>Employees Compensation Commission</u> Auditor's Opinion: <u>Unmodified/Unqualified</u>

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
1	ECC building amounting to P144.128 million determined in CY 2014 was not updated, and the fair values of the land where the ECC building stands and Center's building were not disclosed in the financial statements (FS),	 to undertake the appraisal of the ECC building, ECC land located in Makati City and Center's building in Quezon City, and disclose in the FS the current/updated fair values of the said properties; and b.Issue a policy on appraisal or revaluation of PE to include the frequency or necessity of the appraisal in order to determine the changes in their fair values and 	Complied. The Appraisal Report was completed and received Complied. Office Order No. 360 was issued re Guidelines on the Appraisal of ECC	27 September 2022 1 August 2022

COA A	udit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
account inc amounting t that have re outstanding three to 16 casts doubt the payable Paragraphs the Concept	ats Payable (AP) ludes liabilities to P1.540 million emained in the books for years, which on the validity of s, contrary to 3.2 and 3.4 of tual Framework y Public Sector	 a. Verify each payable account to determine if the long outstanding balances were merely caused by coding errors; b. Scrutinize the agreements/ contracts with the creditors, particularly on the expiry provisions within which the creditors can file for the claims; c. Record appropriate accounting entries for recommendations (a) and (b); d. After conducting recommendations (a) and (b), send notices to payees of valid payables, have them file their claims with EC and immediately pay the amounts due them; and e. Set target dues within which to clear the books of these long outstanding payables. 	The Finance Division has started the verification of the listed accounts payable. Concerned divisions/units of the ECC have been informed and asked to provide status of the agreements/purchase orders with	By EO 2022

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
3	Management was still unable to come up with one Restructuring Plan (RP) for approval of the Governance Commission for Government Owned or Controlled Corporations (GCG) to effect the Organizational Structure and Staffing Pattern appropriate for an integrated function and business of both ECC and OSHC which resulted in: (a) redundancy of	Management:	Continuing compliance. A Board Resolution was prepared, for presentation to the Governing Board, authorizing the commencement of reorganization of the ECC and the OSHC	
	positions and functions of ECC and OSHC and (b) accountabilities and responsibilities of ECC and OSHC's officials and employees are not properly defined. Such delay in the finalization of the RP entails higher administrative cost amounting to P12.594 million.	 b. In the meantime, that the RP is not yet available, the ECC Board has to revisit the current organizational set up of the ECC and Center and to come up with appropriate guidelines to ensure proper check and balance in all of its transactions. The same should be considered in the proposed RP. 	Continuing compliance. A Board Resolution was prepared, for presentation to the Governing Board, approving the timelines of the reorganization of the ECC and the OSHC	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
4	The continuous inability of the	We reiterated with modification our	Continuing compliance.	
	ECC to enforce the audit recommendation to revoke/terminate the	that Management:	(Please see also 2020 Obs.2)	
		a.Recommend to the ECC Board of		
	Employers' Confederation of	Directors the revocation/termination	Received OP reply on the issue of ECOP'S	
	the Philippines (ECOP), a	of the board resolution granting	occupancy on the portion of the ECC	
	private organization, free occupancy of ECC's office	ECOP the free occupancy of ECC's office space;	Building that OP interposes no objection	
	space resulted in opportunity loss estimated at P8.163		Forwarded the OP reply to ECOP	August 16, 2022
	million in rental income from CYs 2019 to 2021, thereby depriving the ECC of the much - needed funds for the benefits of its members.	 b. Have ECOP enter a lease contract with ECC with rental rates based on the prevailing rate of the other leases of the ECC building; c. Determine applicable rental rates for the years 2019 to 2021 for the office space occupied by ECOP and issue billing statements/statement of accounts to collect the rents from 		
		ECOP; and d. If a lease agreement is not reached, offer the space to tenants through public bidding.		

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
5	Other non-current assets account includes unserviceable properties amounting to P216,051 that remained undisposed due to non-determination of the	the unserviceable properties through the appropriate mode of	Continuing compliance. (Please see also 2020 Obs.3)	
		b.Submit to the Audit Team the Inventory and Inspection Report on Unserviceable Property (IIRUP).	Continuing compliance. The Inventory and Inspection Report (IIR) will be submitted COA upon completion of computation of appraised value by 1 st Q 2023	
	cost of maintaining the properties including the storage space.	This will be submitted to the ECC Bids and Awards Committee for disposal in order to determine the proper mode of disposition of said unserviceable properties. The target date to dispose these unserviceable properties is by the first semester of CY 2022.	Not yet disposed. Still finalizing the appraised value of the unserviceable properties; ongoing canvass of junk properties; delay was due to retrieval of other unserviceable items from the REUs	
		However, even prior to the pandemic, Management did not take action in determining the proper mode of disposal for these unserviceable assets. The division in charge could at least had an inventory count to properly account the assets for disposal.		

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
6	The amount of time consumed on the evaluation of applications for cash assistance up to the issuance of the corresponding checks took longer than eight (8) days and 30 minutes as	handling processes that are usually handled by senior employees who are due for retirement in the coming	Continuing compliance.	
		equipment to hasten office tasks and upgrade the cash assistance online application system for fast and accurate data processing and to meet the demands;	Complied.	
	The second statement in the second statement is a second statement of the second sta	 c. Practice resiliency by temporarily delegating tasks to other divisions; and 	Continuing compliance.	
		d. Strictly comply with the prescribed processing time in the ECC Citizen's Charter and Section 9 of	Complied.	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Take Comments/Compli	and the state of the		Timeline
7	The absence of a guideline to implement the Katulong at Gabay ng Manggagawang may Kapansanan (KAGABAY) Program may result in the payment of the starter/ complimentary kit to unqualified ECC members, therefore not aligned with the objectives of the KAGABAY Program and contradicts Section 2 of P.D. No. 1445.	We recommended that Management formulate and immediately issue a guideline/policy on the implementation of the KAGABAY Program to comply with Section 2 of P.D. No. 1445.	The preparation on the in the Provision of	he review of Prosthesis,	Orthosis,	Ongoing
8	The absence of a property or inventory card to monitor the movement of Information, Education and Communication (IEC) materials may result in overstocking, obsolescence, damage and/or loss and uncertainty of the correctness of the quantity on hand, contrary to Section 2 of P.D. No. 1445.	 a. Conduct physical inventory count of the IEC materials and submit to the Audit Team the corresponding Inventory Report; b. Prepare and maintain property or inventory cards to monitor the stock movement of each IEC material; c. Consider the current stock level of IEC materials in succeeding procurement, development and or printing; and d. Study the possibility of distributing the old IEC materials which are still usable. 	Continuing complia ECP A Guide for Employees An Employer's Guide on ECP FAQ ECP ECC Infocomics ECP Occupational and Work-related Board Resolution PD 626, as amended PD 626 (version March 15, 2022) KaGabay	ance. 3 rd Q distribution 68,190 22,032 0 2,803 20,021 1,860 1,260 0 0 0	Balance 3 rd Q 6,055 13,566 0 0 1,733 310 565 948 0	Continuing

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
9	setting the estimated travel time for the routes taken by drivers providing shuttle services to employees hampered the determination of the reasonableness of	include, among others, a provision on the estimated travel time for the different routes/destinations of service drivers; and Require the Administrative Division to monitor the overtime services	Complied. Continuing	
10	The Daily Time Records of ECC employees who were assigned at the Department of Health (DOH) were not supported with the biometric/ machine - stamped bundy time cards or a log book as	Book V of EO 292 and CSC MC No. 21 s. 1991, on the use of bundy clock and other records of	Complied.	
	required under Section 2, Rule XVII of the Omnibus Rule Implementing Book V of EO 292 and Civil Service Commission Memorandum Circular (CSC -MC) No. 21, s. 1991, in relation to Section 13.b.6. of CSC MC No. 24, s. 2017, thus, the validity of the reported attendance and	clock, require the employees to submit to ECC and to the Audit Team either of the three: (1) photocopy of attendance of book;	Complied.	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
	accuracy of the salaries and			
	benefits paid to these employees cannot be ascertained.			
11	documents covering the period January 1 to December 31, 2021 were not submitted to the Audit Team within the prescribed period,	100 and 107 of P.D. No. 1445; and		
	contrary to Sections 100 and 107 of P.D. No. 1445, which prevented the timely disclosure of any deficiencies and issuance of corresponding audit action.	b. Submit immediately the DVs and supporting documents not yet submitted as of February 18, 2022.		
CY	2020 AAR			
1		a. Fast track the preparation and submission to GCG of the required Restructuring Plan that considers the proper delineation of the accountabilities and responsibilities of the ECC Executive Director as well as the Center's officials and employees, the Center being a department of ECC, to avoid redundancy of positions and functions;		

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
	positions and functions of	b.In the meantime, that the	Continuing compliance.	
	ECC and OSHC and (b) accountabilities and responsibilities of ECC and OSHC's officials and employees are not properly defined. Such delay in the finalization of the restructuring plan entails	restructuring plan is not yet available, the ECC Board has to	Reiterated in 2021 Obs. 3 A Board Resolution was prepared, for presentation to the Governing Board, approving the timelines of the	
	higher administrative cost	restructuring plan.		
2	The inability of the Employees' Compensation Commission (ECC) to revoke/terminate the authority granting the Employers' Confederation of the Philippines (ECOP), a private organization, free occupancy of ECC's office space, contrary to Section 4(2) of P.D. No. 1445, resulted in opportunity loss estimated at P5.398 million in rental income for CYs 2019 and 2020.	 a. Revoke/terminate the authority granting ECOP a free occupancy of ECC's office space; b. Have ECOP enter a lease contract with ECC with rental rates based on the prevailing rate of the other leases of ECC building; and c. If a lease agreement is not reached, offer the space to other tenants through public bidding. 		
3	The ECC did not conduct physical inventory or submit an Inventory Report on Property and Equipment	unserviceable properties in	Not implemented for CY 2020. Reiterated with modification in Obs. No. 5	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
	and V of COA Circular No. 80 -124. Also, the PE accounts include unserviceable PEs with carrying amount of P94,557, contrary to Paragraph 82 of International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) 17.			
CY	2019 AAR			
1	The EC did not avail of the free internet service of the Department of information and Communication Technology (DICT) which could have reduced the ECC's Communication expenses by P302,858.00 for CY 2019.	 a. Immediately request and closely coordinate with DICT for their availment of free internet service pursuant to RA No. 10844; and b. Terminate the contract with Source Telecom Inc. upon the availability of the free internet from DICT. 	No update received from DICT as of September 30, 2022	
CY	2015 AAR			
1	Two parcels of land valued at P167,483.00 acquired through foreclosure were not consolidated in the name of the ECC notwithstanding the lapse of six years after the expiration of the one-year redemption period.			

COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
The Subject Properties are located at Brgy. Miranda, Municipality of Talisay, Batangas, which contains a total area of Eight Thousand Four Hundred Sixty-Six (8,466) square meters, more or less, covered by TCT Nos. T-27984 and T-27985.			

Prepared by:

CLAUDINE B. RODRIGUEZ IAU [(D) - ECC OO 294]

19 January 2023

Noted by:

ENGR. JOSE MARIA S. BATINO, CESO IV Acting Executive Director

Updates/Status of Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation On the CY 2021 COA Annual Audit Report and Prior Years Audit Findings and Recommendations As of June 30, 2022

Regional Office/Attached Agency: <u>Employees Compensation Commission</u> Auditor's Opinion: <u>Unmodified/Ungualified</u>

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
1	The appraised value of the ECC building amounting to P144.128 million determined in CY 2014 was not updated, and the fair values of the land where the ECC building stands and Center's building were not disclosed in the financial statements (FS),	to undertake the appraisal of the ECC building, ECC land located in Makati City and Center's building in Quezon City, and disclose in the FS the current/updated fair values of	of the ECC Building. Drafted the policy on appraisal and	Partially Complied
	thus, complete information relevant to the understanding of the ECC's Property and Equipment (PE) account as required under Paragraphs 45 and 94 of International Public Sector Accounting Standard (IPSAS) 17 were not provided to the users of the FS	revaluation of PE to include the frequency or necessity of the appraisal in order to determine the changes in their fair values and	The actual appraisal of the property has been done by said supplier last June 2022 and we are currently awaiting the submission of the appraisal report on current/updated fair values which will be disclosed in the ECC FS.	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
2	The Accounts Payable (AP) account includes liabilities amounting to P1.540 million that have remained outstanding in the books for three to 16 years, which casts doubt on the validity of the payables, contrary to	 a. Verify each payable account to determine if the long outstanding balances were merely caused by coding errors; 	The Finance Division has started the verification of the listed accounts payable. Concerned divisions/units of the ECC have been informed and asked to provide status of the agreements/purchase orders with suppliers/creditors for the immediate processing of the payments.	Partially Complied
	Paragraphs 3.2 and 3.4 of the Conceptual Framework for GPFR by Public Sector Entities.	b.Scrutinize the agreements/ contracts with the creditors, particularly on the expiry provisions within which the creditors can file for the claims;	verification of the accounts. Adjustments	
		c. Record appropriate accounting entries for recommendations a and b;		
		d.After conducting recommendations (a) and (b), send notices to payees of valid payables, have them file their claims with EC and immediately pay the amounts due them; and		
		e. Set target dues within which to clear the books of these long outstanding payables.		

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
3	Management was still unable to come up with one Restructuring Plan (RP) for approval of the Governance Commission for Government Owned or Controlled Corporations (GCG) to effect the Organizational Structure and Staffing Pattern appropriate for an integrated function and business of both ECC and OSHC which resulted in: (a) redundancy of positions and functions of ECC and OSHC and (b) accountabilities and responsibilities of ECC and OSHC's officials and employees are not properly defined. Such delay in the finalization of the RP entails higher administrative cost amounting to P12.594 million.	Management: a. Fast track the preparation and submission to GCG of the required RP that considers the proper delineation of the accountabilities and responsibilities of the ECC Executive Director as well as the Center's officials and employees, the Center being a department of ECC, to avoid redundancy of positions and functions; and	 hiring of a consultant. A draft terms of reference (TOR) for the hiring of a consultant has been outlined and awaiting response from possible/interested service providers. It was also agreed that OSHC come up with positions/job titles in the draft reorganized divisions to determine redundant positions. A CMT composed of ECC-OSHC will conduct a meeting for the finalization of TOR and profiling of possible consultants to 	Ongoing

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
4	ECC to enforce the audit recommendation to revoke/terminate the authority granting the Employers' Confederation of the Philippines (ECOP), a private organization, free occupancy of ECC's office space resulted in opportunity	 that Management: a. Recommend to the ECC Board of Directors the revocation/termination of the board resolution granting ECOP the free occupancy of ECC's office space; b. Have ECOP enter a lease contract with ECC with rental rates based on the prevailing rate of the other leases of the ECC building; c. Determine applicable rental rates for the years 2019 to 2021 for the 	On 24 March 2022, ECOP wrote to Department of Finance Secretary Carlos Dominguez to seek for assistance regarding their request to OP for a written approval of the continued free use of their present office space at the ECC Building. The said letter was endorsed to DOLE by OP for which ECC drafted a reply reiterating the DOLE Secretary's earlier support for the continued free use of the present office space at the ECC Building. On May 20, 2022 a letter from the Office of the President signed by Executive Secretary Salvador C. Medialdea was received by the ECC. It stated that the Office of the President interposes no objection to the continued provision by the	Partially implemented (Please see also 2020 Obs.2 on page 11)

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
5	account includes unserviceable properties amounting to P216,051 that remained undisposed due to	 a. Facilitate the immediate disposal of the unserviceable properties through the appropriate mode of disposal and submit the relevant reports to the Audit Team; and b. Submit to the Audit Team; and more row of Inserviceable property (IIRUP). This will be submitted to the ECC Bids and Awards Committee for disposal in order to determine the proper mode of disposition of said unserviceable properties. The target date to dispose these unserviceable properties is by the first semester of CY 2022. However, even prior to the pandemic, Management did not take action in determining the proper mode of disposal for these unserviceable assets. The division in charge could at least had an inventory count to properly account the assets for disposal .	 The following activities are currently being undertaken by the Supply Section: Inventory of ECC Central Office and REUs to retrieve unserviceable PPE/SX; Taking photos of unserviceable properties; Preparation of IIR 	Ongoing (Please see also 2020 Obs.3 on page 13)

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
6	The amount of time consumed on the evaluation of applications for cash assistance up to the issuance of the corresponding checks took longer than eight (8) days and 30 minutes as prescribed in the ECC Citizen's Charter, and longer than 20 working days as required under Section 9(b) of Republic Act (R.A.) No. 11032 or the Ease of Doing Business and Efficient Government Service Delivery Act (EODB Act) due to shortage on manpower and other technical issues that affected the efficiency of the process resulting in the delayed receipt of cash assistance by ECC members and their dependents.	 a.Be more aggressive in hiring permanent staffs to be trained in handling processes that are usually handled by senior employees who are due for retirement in the coming years; b.Invest on heavy-duty office equipment to hasten office tasks 	laptops, printers and mobile phones were	Partially Complied
		and upgrade the cash assistance online application system for fast		

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
		and accurate data processing and to meet the demands;		
		c. Practice resiliency by temporarily delegating tasks to other divisions; and		
		d. Strictly comply with the prescribed processing time in the ECC Citizen's Charter and Section 9 of the Republic Act (RA) No. 11032 or the EODB Act.	Charter with some streamlined PCTs, specifically on Cash Assistance Procedure	
7	The absence of a guideline to implement the Katulong at Gabay ng Manggagawang may Kapansanan (KAGABAY) Program may result in the payment of the starter/ complimentary kit to unqualified ECC members, therefore not aligned with the	We recommended that Management formulate and immediately issue a guideline/policy on the implementation of the KAGABAY Program to comply with Section 2 of P.D. No. 1445.	instructed by the Executive Director to review and update the different existing guidelines relating to ECC rehabilitation	Ongoing

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actior Comments/	ns Taken/N Complianc	Contraction of the second s		Timeline
	objectives of the KAGABAY Program and contradicts Section 2 of P.D. No. 1445.		The revised April 2022. The preparat in the Provis Assistive Dev	ion on the re sion of Pro	eview of (osthesis,	Guidelines Orthosis,	
8	The absence of a property or inventory card to monitor the	a.Conduct physical inventory count of the IEC materials and submit to	is ongoing Continuing co	ompliance.			Partially Complied
	movement of Information, Education and	the Audit Team the corresponding Inventory Report;		2 nd Q distribution	Balance as of 2 nd Q	Remarks	
	Communication (IEC)	b.Prepare and maintain property or		IEC mater	ials		
	materials may result in overstocking, obsolescence,	inventory cards to monitor the stock movement of each IEC	ECP A Guide for Employees	84,860	31,820		
	damage and/or loss and	material;	An Employer's Guide on ECP	12,445	35,563		
	uncertainty of the correctness	c. Consider the current stock level of	FAQ ECP	9,435	0	for printing	
	of the quantity on hand, contrary to Section 2 of P.D. No. 1445.	IEC materials in succeeding procurement, development and or printing; and	ECC Infocomics ECP Occupational and Work- related	28,145 32,285	0 3,603		
		d.Study the possibility of distributing the old IEC materials which are still	Board Resolution	1,345	295		
		usable.	PD 626, as amended	3,415	565		
			PD 626 (version March 15, 2022) KAGABAY	-	948		
9	Lack of policy/guideline setting the estimated travel time for the routes taken by drivers providing shuttle services to employees	Establish a policy/guidelines on overtime services which should include, among others, a provision on the estimated travel time for the	Office Order also in conso	No. 16-55 nance with	1 S.2016 Joint Circ	, which is cular no. 1,	Complied

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
	hampered the determination of the reasonableness of billed hours beyond the	different routes/destinations of service drivers; and	OT service & OT Pay for Government Employees.	
		Require the Administrative Division to monitor the overtime services rendered by the ECC employees and their compliance to existing rules and regulations.	Done and continuing	
10	The Daily Time Records of ECC employees who were assigned at the Department of Health (DOH) were not supported with the biometric/ machine - stamped bundy time cards or a log book as required under Section 2,	Book V of EO 292 and CSC MC No.	Secretary (OSEC) DOH thru Atty. Fatima P. Laperal, Head EA, to submit to certified true copy of the attendance logbook of Ms.	Complied
		b. In the absence of the Office Order as an exemption on the use of bundy clock, require the employees to submit to ECC and to the Audit		
	Circular (CSC -MC) No. 21, s. 1991, in relation to Section 13.b.6. of CSC MC No. 24, s. 2017, thus, the validity of the reported attendance and	Team either of the three: (1) photocopy of attendance of book; (2) machine-stamped bundy clock card or; (3) extracted attendance from biometric time clock.	AOM was sent to COA OIC Supervising Auditor thru Ms. Eleonor Navarro and Ms.	
	accuracy of the salaries and benefits paid to these employees cannot be ascertained.		Another memo on monitoring and submission on Monthly Attendance to ECC –Admin Division dated March 2, 2022 was disseminated to all EAs	

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
11	documents covering the period January 1 to December 31, 2021 were not submitted to the Audit Team within the prescribed period,	 a. Install measures that will facilitate the timely submission of DVs not later than the fifth day of the ensuing month in compliance with Sections 100 and 107 of P.D. No. 1445; and b. Submit immediately the DVs and supporting documents not yet submitted as of February 18, 2022. 	 The Finance Division is doing its best effort to comply with the COA requirement on the submission of processed DVs. 88.09% or 11,075 out of the 12,572 Disbursement Vouchers (DVs) processed in 2021 were already submitted to COA as of June 30, 2022. The reason for the non-submission is due to the unclaimed checks for cash assistance. To date the Finance Division is in 	Partially Complied
CV	2020 AAR		compliance with the monthly submission requirement of COA of the processed DVs.	
1		a.Fast track the preparation and submission to GCG of the required Restructuring Plan that considers the proper delineation of the accountabilities and responsibilities of the ECC Executive Director as well as the Center's officials and employees, the Center being a department of ECC, to avoid redundancy of positions and functions;	A Board Resolution approving the separate Restructuring Plan of ECC was initially signed by the Members of the Board of Commission, except for the Chairman, (BR 20-11-32) who requested for further discussion	Not implemented. Reiterated in 2021 Obs. 4
	resulted in: (a) redundancy of positions and functions of ECC and OSHC and (b)	restructuring plan is not yet	A CMT composed of ECC-OSHC will conduct a meeting for the finalization of	Partially implemented

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
	accountabilities and responsibilities of ECC and OSHC's officials and employees are not properly defined. Such delay in the finalization of the restructuring plan entails higher administrative cost	revisit the current organizational set up of the ECC Center and to come up with appropriate guidelines to ensure proper check and balance of all its transactions. The same should be considered in the proposed restructuring plan.	TOR and profiling of possible consultants to do the project.	Reiterated in 2021 Obs. 4
2	The inability of the Employees' Compensation Commission (ECC) to revoke/terminate the authority granting the Employers' Confederation of the Philippines (ECOP), a private organization, free occupancy of ECC's office space, contrary to Section 4(2) of P.D. No. 1445, resulted in opportunity loss estimated at P5.398 million in rental income for CYs 2019 and 2020.	 a.Revoke/terminate the authority granting ECOP a free occupancy of ECC's office space; b.Have ECOP enter a lease contract with ECC with rental rates based on the prevailing rate of the other leases of ECC building; and 	The matter was discussed during the March 11 Board meeting considering that the Presidential authority granted to the ECOP was confirmed by the Board through a Board Resolution. The latest AOM was referred to ECOP for info, as instructed by the Board. As per latest information from ECOP, they are still further pursuing with OP a positive response to their earlier request to continually locate their office at the ECC Building at no rental fee. This despite the earlier OP action of referring back the request of ECOP, thru DOLE, to ECC for appropriate coordination with COA.	Reiterated with modification Reiterated in 2021 Obs. 4 in page 4
		c. If a lease agreement is not reached, offer the space to other tenants through public bidding.		

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
			approval of the continued free use of their present office space at the ECC Building. The said letter was endorsed to DOLE by OP for which ECC drafted a reply reiterating the DOLE Secretary's earlier support for the continued free use of the present office space at the ECC Building.	
			On May 20, 2022 a letter from the Office of the President signed by Executive Secretary Salvador C. Medialdea was received by the ECC. It stated that the Office of the President interposes no objection to the continued provision by the ECC to ECOP of free use and occupancy of the Subject Property, subject to existing and applicable, laws, rules, and regulations.	
			ECC sent a copy of the letter from OP to COA for information. COA is awaiting for the position of their legal office on the matter.	
3		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		Not implemented Reiterated with modification in Obs. No. 5 in page 5

	COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
	include unserviceable PEs with carrying amount of P94,557, contrary to Paragraph 82 of International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) 17.	amounts of the unserviceable properties after their disposal.		
CY	2019 AAR			
1	The EC did not avail of the free internet service of the Department of information and Communication Technology (DICT) which	a. Immediately request and closely coordinate with DICT for their availment of free internet service pursuant to RA No. 10844; and		Partially implemented
	could have reduced the ECC's Communication expenses by P302,858.00 for CY 2019.	b.Terminate the contract with Source Telecom Inc. upon the availability of the free internet from DICT.	Due to the increasing demand of internet bandwidth and the non-action of the DICT to the request and follow-up, the ECC resorted to upgrading the internet bandwidth via third-party service provider. A new contract for upgraded internet service was signed and took effect in April 2022.	Implemented
CY	2015 AAR			
1	Two parcels of land valued at P167,483.00 acquired through foreclosure were not consolidated in the name of the ECC notwithstanding the lapse of six years after the expiration of the one-year redemption period.	Expedite the consolidation of titles of the foreclosed two parcels of land in the name of the ECC.	 The following were the actions taken by Appeals Division: 1. In order to consolidate the title in the name of ECC, an exemption from the CARP coverage is necessary. 2. The ECC wrote a Letter of Inquiry to the Department of Agrarian Reform (DAR) for further clarification regarding 	Partially Implemented Petition for the CARP Exception Order will be filed before the Municipal Agrarian

COA Audit Findings	COA Audit Recommendations	Actions Taken/Management Comments/Compliance/Implementation	Timeline
The Subject Properties are located at Brgy. Miranda, Municipality of Talisay, Batangas, which contains a total area of Eight Thousand Four Hundred Sixty-Six (8,466) square meters, more or less, covered by TCT Nos. T-27984 and T-27985.		 Comprehensive Agrarian Reform Program (CARP) policy on relation to Government Owned Lands on 28 February 2018. In its letter-reply dated 24 September 2019, the DAR replied that it incumbent upon the land owner to prove that his land is exempt from CARP coverage; the ECC must file for an Exemption Order or Clearance because the exemption is not automatic. The Appeals Division has prepared the draft of the Petition for CARP Exemption or Exclusion of the subject properties. 	Tanauan, Batangas, on October 2022 upon completion of the collation of the proper

Prepared by:

CLAUDINE B. RODRIGUEZ IAU [(D) -ECC OO 294]

2 August 2022

Noted by:

1 STELLA ZIPAGAN-BANAWIS **Executive Director**